

Princeton University
Department of Anthropology

RELIGION AND MEDICINE

ANT 218
W 7:30-10:20 PM
Fall 2009

Prof. João Biehl
128 Aaron Burr Hall
Phone: 258-6327
Email: jbiehl@princeton.edu
Office Hours: Th 3:15-4:15 pm

Teaching Assistant: George Laufenberg (glaufenb@princeton.edu)
Office hours: Tu 4:30-5:30 pm (Aaron Burr lounge)

Course Description

The seminar examines the encounter of religion and biomedicine. We will situate this encounter historically and we will approach contemporary illness experiences and therapeutic interventions as they are related to various religious practices. We will specifically look at the mind-body interface as people deal with disease and suffering and investigate how new medical technologies intermingle with belief systems, self-fashioning, and local forms of care. We will also consider how the themes of sacrifice and salvation are actualized in humanitarian and global health interventions and theorize emerging notions of wellbeing and human agency. Students will learn to conduct ethnographic interviews and to analyze representations of religious experience.

Requirements/Grading

The success of the seminar depends on your commitment to complete all required readings for each session, to critically reflect on the readings, to participate actively in the discussions, and to creatively integrate these insights in the papers, meant to be an exploratory forum of your own interests in the religion/medicine interface.

Grading will be based on:

- Attendance, participation, and a group presentation (*15% of the grade*).
- A reading report has to be turned in every Wednesday in class, beginning on September 30 and ending on December 9, and should cover the materials

assigned for that week. The report should not be more than one double-spaced page—**please, adhere to this limit** (15 % of the grade).

- A short paper (6-8 double-spaced pages): an analysis of an interview you conducted with someone (in your family or circle of friends) who has drawn from religion to deal with disease and treatment. You might also consider analyzing a personal account found in memoirs or documentary films. The assignment is due on October 30 at 5 pm at 116 Aaron Burr Hall (30 % of the grade).
- A short research paper (8-10 double-spaced pages) addressing the interface of religion and medicine at a community or institutional or policy level (library-based research OR through a project sponsored by Princeton's Community Based Learning Initiative, CBLI). The final paper is due on January 12 at 5 pm (40% of the grade).

Course Materials

The following required books will be on reserve at Firestone Library and they can be purchased at the U-Store. Additional articles and book chapters can be downloaded from Blackboard's electronic reserve.

- Biehl, João. *Will to Live: AIDS Therapies and the Politics of Survival*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009.
- De Certeau, Michel. *The Possession at Loudon*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 2000.
- Harrington, Anne. *The Cure Within: A History of Mind-body Medicine*. New York: W.W. Norton, 2009.
- Jackson, Michael. *The Palm at the End of the Mind: Relatedness, Religiosity, and the Real*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009.
- Kidder, Tracy. *Mountains beyond Mountains: The Quest of Dr. Paul Farmer, a Man who would Cure the World*. New York: Random House, 2004.

September 23

Religion/Medicine—Contemporary Tensions

- Pilcher, Helen. “The science of voodoo: When mind attacks body.” *New Scientist*, May 13, 2009.
(<http://www.newscientist.com/article/mg20227081.100-the-science-of-voodoo-when-mind-attacks-body.html?page=3>).
- Gross, Jane. “Sisters Face Death with Dignity and Reverence.” *New York Times*, July 9, 2009.
(http://www.nytimes.com/2009/07/09/health/09sisters.html?_r=1).
- In the News:
 - Terry Schiavo
 - “Congress Passes and Bush Signs Legislation on Schiavo Case”
(http://www.nytimes.com/2005/03/21/politics/21debate.html?_r=1&pagewanted=print&position=
 - “Frist Defends Remarks on Schiavo Case”
<http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/06/16/AR2005061600501.html>
 - Daniel Hauser
 - “When a Child Refuses Chemotherapy”
(<http://parenting.blogs.nytimes.com/2009/05/11/when-a-child-refuses-chemotherapy/?pagemode=print>)
 - “US cancer teen 'to get treatment'”
(<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/americas/8069375.stm>)
 - Falun Gong/China
 - “China Still Presses Crusade Against Falun Gong”
(<http://www.nytimes.com/2009/04/28/world/asia/28china.html?pagewanted=print>)
 - “How China Got Religion”
(<http://www.nytimes.com/2007/10/11/opinion/11zizek.html>)
 - Pope Benedict XVI
 - “Pope, in Africa, Says Condoms Aren’t the Way to Fight H.I.V.”
(<http://www.nytimes.com/2009/03/18/world/africa/18pope.html?fta=y&pagewanted=print>)
 - “Pope: Condoms 'Increase' AIDS Epidemic in Africa”
(http://www.foxnews.com/printer_friendly_story/0,3566,509488,00.html)
- Film: *Worlds Apart: A Series on Cross Cultural Health Care* (2003)

September 30

On Religious Experience, Pain, and Making the Body Speak

- De Certeau, Michel. *The Possession at Loudon*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000. (Selections)
- James, William. "Lectures XX: Conclusions." In *The Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature*. New York: Random House, 1994, pp. 528-564.
- Jackson, Michael. *The Palm at the End of the Mind: Relatedness, Religiosity, and the Real*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009, pp. xi-xiv, 1-8.
- Weber, Max. "The Validity of Legitimate Authority: Tradition, Faith, Law." In *Basic Concepts in Sociology*. Secaucus, NJ: The Citadel Press, 1972, pp. 81-83.
- Kleinman, Arthur. "Opening Remarks: Pain and Experience." In *Pain and its transformations: The Interface of Biology and Culture* edited by Sarah Coakley and Kay Kaufman Shelemay. Boston: Harvard University Press, 2007, pp. 17-20.
- Luhrmann, Tanya. "God as the Ground of Empathy." In *Anthropology Today*, 2000, 16(1):19-20.

- Optional:
 - * Bynum, Caroline Walker. "Women Mystics and Eucharistic Devotion in the Thirteenth Century." In *Beyond the Body Proper: Reading the Anthropology of Material Life*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007, pp. 202-216.
 - * Coakley, Sarah. "Palliative or Intensification? Pain and Christian Contemplation in the Spirituality of Sixteenth-Century Carmelites." In *Pain and its transformations: the interface of biology and culture*. Pp. 77-99.
 - * Boon, James A. "Anthropology, Ethnology, and Religion." In L. Jones, ed., *Encyclopedia of Religion, Vol. 1*. 1987, pp. 308-316.

October 7

Mind-Body Medicine and Power

- Harrington, Anne. *The Cure Within: A History of Mind-Body Medicine*, New York: W.W. Norton, 2009, pp. 15-101.
- Freud, Sigmund. "Psychoanalysis and Religious Origins (1919)." In *Character and Culture* edited by Philip Rieff. New York: Collier Books, 1963, pp. 222-227.
- Freud, Sigmund. "Religious Experience." In *Collected Papers, Vol. 5* edited by James Strachey. New York: Basic Books, 1928, pp. 243-246.
- Biehl, João. "The Mucker War: Enlightenment and Political Violence in Post-Colonial Brazil." In *Postcolonial Disorders* edited by Mary-Jo DelVecchio Good, Sandra Hyde, Byron Good, and Sarah Pinto. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007, pp. 279-308.
- Csordas, Thomas. "Transmutation of Sensibilities: Empathy, Intuition, Revelation." In *The Shadow Side of Fieldwork: Exploring the Blurred Borders between Ethnography and Life* edited by Athena McClean and Annete Leibing. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2007, pp. 106-116.

- Luhrmann, Tanya M. "Metakinesis: How God Becomes Intimate in Contemporary U.S. Christianity." *American Anthropologist*, 2004, 106(3):518-528.
- Film: *Mystic brain: Scientists Meet Spirituality Heads-On* by Isabelle Raynald (2006).
- Optional:
 - * Scarry, Elaine. *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987, pp. 3-23.
 - * Comaroff, Jean. *Body of Power, Spirit of Resistance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985, pp. 194-251.
 - * Jackson, Michael. "The Prose of Suffering and the Practice of Silence." *Spiritus* 2004 (4):44-59.
 - * Csordas, Thomas. "Words from the Holy People: a case study in cultural phenomenology." In *Embodiment and Experience: The Existential Ground of Culture and Self* edited by Thomas Csordas. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994, pp. 269-290.

October 14

Sorcery and Healing

- Evans-Pritchard, E.E. *Witchcraft, Magic and the Oracles among the Azande*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1937, pp. 21-39, 63-83, 540-544.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude. "The Sorcerer and His Magic." In *Structural Anthropology*. New York: Anchor Books, 1967, pp. 167-185.
- Favret-Saada, Jeanne. *Deadly Words: Witchcraft in the Bocage*. Trans. Catherine Cullen. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1980, pp. 1-28, 97-109, 254-266.
- Jackson, Michael. *The Palm at the End of the Mind: Relatedness, Religiosity, and the Real*, pp. 8-51.
- Ashforth, Adam. "On living in a world with witches Everyday epistemology and spiritual insecurity in a modern African city (Soweto)." In *Magical interpretations, material realities: modernity, witchcraft and the Occult in Postcolonial Africa* edited by Henrietta L. Moore and Todd Sanders. New York: Routledge, 2001, pp. 206-225.
- Film: *The Shaman's Apprentice* by Miranda Smith (2001).
- Optional:
 - * Good, Byron. "Medical Anthropology and the Problem of Belief." *Medicine, Rationality, and Experience*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 1-24.
 - * Taussig, Michael. *Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man: A Study in Terror and Healing*. Chicago : University of Chicago Press, 1986, pp. 171-187, 209-220, 284-286, 322-330, 402-412.
 - * Gordillo, Gastón R. *Landscapes of Devils: Tensions of Place and Memory in the Argentine Chaco*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004, pp. 88-100, 169-183.
 - * Ashforth, Adam. "An Epidemic of Witchcraft? The Implications of AIDS for the Post-Apartheid State." *African Studies*, 2002. 61 (1):121-143.

October 21
Saints and Pilgrims

- Garces, Chris and Alexander Jones. "Mauss Redux: From Warfare's Human Toll to *L'homme total*." In *Anthropological Quarterly*, 2009, 82(1):279-309.
- Orsi, Robert. "The Cult of the Saints and the Reimagination of the Space and Time of Sickness in Twentieth-Century American Catholicism." In *Religion and Healing in America* edited by Linda L. Barnes and Susan S. Sered. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005, pp. 29-47.
- Orsi, Robert. *Between Heaven and Earth*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005, pp. 110-145.
- Scheper-Hughes, Nancy. *Death Without Weeping: The Violence of Everyday Life in Brazil*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992, pp. 400-445.
- Hammoudi, Abdellah. *A Season in Mecca*. New York: Hill and Wang, 2006, pp. 119-141.
- Couroucli, Maria. "Sharing Nostalgia in Istanbul: Christian and Muslim Pilgrims to St George's Sanctuary." Author manuscript, published in *Sharing Sacred Space: Religion and Conflict Resolution*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2008.
- Kleinman, Arthur. "Chapter One: Introduction." In *What Really Matters: Living a Moral Life amidst Uncertainty and Danger*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006, pp. 1-26.
- Jackson, Michael. *The Palm at the End of the Mind: Relatedness, Religiosity, and the Real*, pp. 81-84, 94-98, 99-102.
- Optional:
 - * Geertz, Clifford. "Religion as a Cultural System." In *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, 2000, pp. 87-125.
 - * Obeyesekere, Gananath. *The Work of Culture: Symbolic Transformation in Psychoanalysis and Anthropology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990, pp. 3-24.
 - * Orsi, Robert. *Between Heaven and Earth*, pp. 1-18.

October 28
Realities of Mental Illness and Technologies of the Self

- Foucault, Michel. "About the beginning of the hermeneutic of the self." In *The Politics of Truth* edited by Sylvère Lotringer. New York: Semiotext(e), 1997, pp. 168-235.
- Obeyesekere, Gananath. "Depression, Buddhism, and the Work of Culture." In *Culture and Depression: Studies in the Anthropology and Cross-Cultural Psychiatry of Affect and Disorder* edited by Arthur Kleinman and Byron Good. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985, pp. 134-152.

- Good, Byron and Mary-Jo DelVecchio Good. "The Subject of Mental Illness: Psychosis, Mad Violence, and Subjectivity in Indonesia." In *Subjectivity: Ethnographic Investigations* edited by João Biehl, Byron Good, and Arthur Kleinman. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007, pp. 243-272.
- Corin, Ellen. "The Other of Culture in Psychosis: The Ex-centricity of the Subject." In *Subjectivity: Ethnographic Investigations*, pp. 273-314.
- Biehl, João. "Part Two: Catarina and the Alphabet." In *Vita: Life in a Zone of Social Abandonment*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005, pp. 69-119.
- Guest speaker: Trisha Thorne, Princeton's Community-Based Learning Initiative.

*** Fall Break ***

November 11

Contemporary Symptoms and the Cure Within

- Harrington, Anne. *The Cure Within: A History of Mind-Body Medicine*, pp. 103-204.
- Cannon, Walter Bradford. "Voodoo' Death." *American Anthropologist*, 1942, 44:169-181.
- Silberman, Steve. "Placebos Are Getting More Effective. Drugmakers Are Desperate to Know Why." *Wired*, August 24, 2009, 17(9).
- Prayer Studies & Beyond
 - Astin, John A., Elaine Harkness, Edzard Ernst. "The efficacy of "distant healing": a systematic review of randomized trials." *Annals of Internal Medicine*, 2000, 132:903-910.
 - Cha, Kwang Y. et al., "Does prayer influence the success of *in vitro* fertilization-embryo transfer? Report of a masked, randomized trial." *Journal of Reproductive Medicine*, 2001. 46:781-787.
 - Daaleman, Timothy P. and Gary Van de Creek. "Placing religion and spirituality in end- of-life care." *JAMA*, 2000, 248:2514-2517.
 - Geiderman, Joel M. "Faith and doubt." *JAMA*, 2000, 283:1661-1662.
 - Mueller, Paul S. et al. "Religious involvement, spirituality, and medicine: implications for clinical practice." *Mayo Clinic Proceedings*, 2001, 76:1225-1235.
 - Sloan, R.P., E. Bagiella, T. Powell. "Religion, spirituality, and medicine." *The Lancet*, February 20, 1999, 353:664-667.
 - Tarpley, John, Tarpley, Margaret. "Spirituality in surgical practice." *Journal of the American College of Surgeons*, 2002, 194:642-647.
 - Waldfoegel, Shimon. "Spirituality in medicine." *Primary Care*, 1997, 24:963-976.

November 18

Ancient Traditions, the Spirit of Capitalism, and Alternative Medicine

- Harrington, Anne. *The Cure Within: A History of Mind-Body Medicine*, pp. 205-255.
- Weber, Max. "The Protestant Sects and the Spirit of Capitalism." In *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*, edited by H.H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills. New York: Oxford University Press, 1958, pp. 302-322.
- Bateson, Gregory. "The Cybernetics of 'Self': A Theory of Alcoholism." In *Steps to an Ecology of Mind*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000, pp. 309-337.
- Pazderic, Nickola. "Recovering True Selves in the Electro-Spiritual Field of Universal Love." *Cultural Anthropology*, 2004, 19(2):196-225.
- Mohatt, Gerald and Joseph Eagle Elk. *The Price of a Gift: A Lakota Healer's Story*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 2000, pp. 15-26, 130-152, 159-195.
- Barnes, Linda L. "Practitioner Decisions to Engage in Chinese Medicine: Cultural Messages Under the Skin." *Medical Anthropology*, 2009, 28(2):141-165.
- Optional:
 - * Clements, William M. "The New Age Sweat Lodge." In *Healing Logics: Culture and Medicine in Modern Health Belief Systems* edited by Erika Brady. Salt Lake City, UT: Utah State University Press, 2001, pp. 143-162.
 - * Hsu, Elizabeth. "The medicine from China has rapid effects: Chinese medicine patients in Tanzania." In *Anthropology & Medicine*, 2002, 9 (3):291:313.
 - * Worsley, Peter. "Non-Western Medical Systems." In *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 1982, 11: 315-348.

November 25

How Everyday Life Continues: Religion and the Aftermath of War and Political Violence

- Film: *40 Years of Silence: An Indonesian Tragedy* by Robert Lemelson.
- Bhabha, Homi K. "Foreword." In *The Wretched of the Earth* by Frantz Fanon. New York: Grove Press, 2004, pp vii-xli.
- Igreja, Victor. "Why Are There So Many Drums Playing until Dawn?' Exploring the Role of Gamba Spirits and Healers in the Post-War Recovery Period in Gorongosa, Central Mozambique', *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 2003, 40:459–87.
- Scheper-Hughes, Nancy. "Violence and the Politics of remorse: Lessons from South Africa." In: *Subjectivity: Ethnographic Investigations*, pp. 179-233.
- Optional:
 - Fanon, Frantz. "Colonial Wars and Mental Disorders." *The Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press, 1963, pp. 249-316.

December 2

***New Medical Technologies:
Rethinking Truth, Sacrifice, and Salvation***

- Hubert, Henri and Marcel Mauss. *Sacrifice: Its Nature and Functions*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981, pp. 95-103.
- Derrida, Jacques. *The Last Interview* (www.studiovisit.net/SV.Derrida.pdf).
- Biehl, João. *Will to Live: AIDS Therapies and the Politics of Survival*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007. (Selections).
- Kaufman, Sharon R. "A Commentary: Hospital Experience and Meaning at the End of Life." In *The Gerontologist*, 2002, 42:34-39.
- Inhorn, Marcia. "Making Muslim Babies: IVF and Gamete Donation in Sunni versus Shi'a Islam." *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, 2006, 30:427-450.
- Scheper-Hughes, Nancy and Mariana Leal Ferreira. "Dombá's Spirit Kidney: Transplant Medicine and Suyá Indian Cosmology." In *Disability in Local and Global Worlds* edited by Benedicte Ingstad and Susan Reynolds Whyte. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007, pp. 149-185.
- Film: *Worlds Apart: A Series on Cross Cultural Health Care* (2003)
- Optional:
* Fenn, Richard. K. *Liturgies and Trials: The Secularization of Religious Language*. New York: Pilgrim Press, 1982. (Selections).

December 9

***Saving Lives:
Religiosity, Humanitarianism, and Health Outcomes***

- Benjamin, Walter. "Theologico-Political Fragment." In *Reflections* edited by Peter Demetz. New York: Schocken Books, 1978, pp. 312-313.
- Farmer, Paul. *Pathologies of Power: health, human rights, and the new war on the poor*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004, pp. 135-159, 160-178.
- Kidder, Tracy. *Mountains beyond Mountains: The Quest of Dr. Paul Farmer, a Man who would Cure the World*. New York: Random House, 2004. (Selections)
- Deaton, Angus. "Aging, religion, and health." Princeton University, 2009, Unpublished Paper.
([http://www.princeton.edu/~deaton/downloads/Religion and Health All Aug ust09.pdf](http://www.princeton.edu/~deaton/downloads/Religion_and_Health_All_August09.pdf))
- Wuthnow, Robert. *Boundless Faith: The Global Outreach of American Churches*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009, pp. 188-250, 295-302.
- Singer, Peter. *The Life You Can Save: Acting Now to End World Poverty*. New York: Random House, 2009, pp. 3-22, 105-128.

- Film: *Acting on Faith: Women's New Religious Activism in America* by Shamita Dasgupta (2005).
- Optional:
* Redfield, Peter. "Doctors, Borders and Life in Crisis." In *Cultural Anthropology*, 2005, 20(3): 328-361.

December 16

General Review and Discussion of Research Projects

- Sontag, Susan. *Regarding the Pain of Others*. New York: Farrar, Strauss, and Giroux, 2003, pp. 18-39, 74-94.
- Fassin, Didier. "Humanitarian as a Politics of Life." *Public Culture*, 2007, 19(3):499-520.